



## THE BHUTTO'S STRATEGIES TOWARDS DEMOCRACY IN PAKISTAN PEOPLE'S PARTY ARENA

*Dr. Nuzhat Zehra*

*Ph.D in Department of Political Science  
University of Karachi  
Karachi - Pakistan*

*Dr. Anita Wilson*

*Ph.D Department of Political Science  
University of Karachi  
Karachi - Pakistan  
[anitawilson133@gmail.com](mailto:anitawilson133@gmail.com)*

### **Abstract**

*Leaders may be rulers but not all rulers, holders and wielders of power are leaders. Hitler ones in power, was an oppressor; he was no leader. Bhutto was both a leader and a ruler. The study aims to shed light on the Bhutto's socio-economic and political journey towards democracy in Pakistan. The democratic leader of the Nation was deeply concerned with the problems of the common people at the grassroots level. Furthermore, he made a slogan of Roti Capra or Makaan to highlights the basic needs of the people, which made him the leader of people. He gives his tremendous contributions towards democracy in Pakistan. He played his significant role in making the constitution of 1973 and made countless efforts to balance the socio-economic situation by making a different strategy. Qualitative method has been used to analyze his struggle for democracy. At last, the findings show the actual phenomena, that no single leader could replace him due to his charismatic leadership and dedication for Pakistan. He sacrificed his life for the safeguard of the democracy.*

**Key Words:** Democracy, Leadership, Pakistan Peoples Party, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto.

### **Introduction**

Democracy is the form of government, which people choose according to their own wish. Infact it is the 'of the people, by the people, for the people' as mentioned the US. President "Abraham Lincoln." (<https://www.britannica.com/topic/democracy/England>)

Unfortunately, however in Pakistan that has never been the matter. The failure to established viable democratic institutions and recurrent constitutional breakdowns has led different debate that democracy has failed, and it does not suit the genius people of Pakistan. (Shafqat, 1989) Even though



Muhammad Ali Jinnah believed that Islam taught us the values of democracy such as equality, tolerance, and justice.

Almost fourteen hundred years ago. “Democracy is in the blood of Musalmans who look upon ample equality of manhood and believe in fertility and liberty.” “Brotherhood, equality and fraternity of man, these are the basic facts of our culture, religion and civilization.” (Jinnah, 1946)

Islam teaches its followers to be tolerant, kind, and passionate. “The tenets of Islam instruct upon every Muslim to provide protection to his neighbors and to the minorities irrespective cast and creed. (Ali, 2007) Since inception, Pakistan has practice various forms of government which comprise Parliamentary, presidential system, military laws, and democracy.

Under the constitution of 1956 Pakistan had experience Parliamentary system but within two years the constitution was suspended, and martial law had been imposed by general Ayub Khan in 1958, then 1962 General Ayub Khan had Introduced presidential system of government in 1962 under the constitution of 1962 in this he presented the system of basic democracies in Pakistan. (Khan, 2009) Unfortunately, due to the corruption and rigging in the elections and nepotism, this system could not flourish in Pakistan.

Moreover, after martial law the new civilian government introduced the new constitution in 1973. According to the constitution of 1973 the new parliamentary form of system was implemented in Pakistan again, furthermore in this time Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was the elected premier of the Pakistan who had completed his 5 years term of his regime (Khan, 2009)

### **The Concept of Charismatic Leadership**

According to Max Weber, Charisma in this regard: “A conclusive quality of an individual personality, by integrity of which he is set apart from common men and treated as endowed with superhuman, supernatural, or at least specifically unprecedented capacities and powers.” (Spencer, 1973.)

Furthermore, we can say that, charismatic authority is the legitimize power on the grounds of a leader’s meritorious personal qualities or a demonstration extraordinary insight and stratagem, which inspire obedience and loyalty from followers. Therefore, this power is situated on the leader, who perceives legitimacy, and the absence of this leader will dissolve the power. Charismatic leadership is not only originated human characteristics but also on the collaboration between the leader and his/her recognizers. The term recognition can be understood as an abandon driven by hope, enthusiasm or faith. Today's leaders conducted to attract public intentions by a charismatic relation which comprised: giving/taking, trust and influence.

In politics the charismatic leadership is although correlated with autocrat, authoritarian, theocrat, and dictator states. Leaders in these systems tend to organize a rooted cult of personality which includes the use of media, propaganda, soft power and other methods in order to assemble an unquestionably



appraised public image, characterized by heroism and perfection, exhibiting traits of narcissism “vanity, egoism, conceit and simple selfishness”. The succession process of this leader will result in a cleavage within the state because power was concentrated around one person. (Weber , 1978) In Pakistan the one and only leader to fulfilled these ideals was perhaps Shaheed Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. It was his compelling magnetic personality inspired the millions of peoples.

### **Early Phase of his Political Carrier 1957 till 1965:**

Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was an intellectual, a mass leader and a ruler. He achieved personal and political milestones at an early age. He rose amongst the people due to his charismatic personality. (Anwar, 1992) He started his political carrier by joining President Iskander Mirza’s cabinet. He persistent to work under general Ayub Khan after the 1958 military enclosure. Although he held numerous ministerial portfolios, as a final point becoming foreign minister in 1963. He was the first young foreign minister of that time.

The best part of his foreign minister era was shed light on the initiative of strategic partnership of Pakistan with China and success in attracting investment and commerce from the countries in the soviet bloc. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto personal preference towards the socialist ideology and his aspiration to be seen as a pro-people politician helped him become the chief architect of Sino-Pak relationship that continues to flourish to this day. (Bhutto, 1948-1966)

He further made Pakistan a prominent associate member of the Non-Aligned Movement, to established closer diplomatic relation with Arab Nationalist-cum-socialist Ba’ath parties and extended support to movements for National Liberation and enlightened change in Latin America, Africa, and Asia. These were tremendous achievements for a newly created developing country in the exceedingly polarized world of the cold war era.

The worst step of his internal politics was that he actively supported Ayub Khan in his presidential referendum against Fatima Jinnah and backed operation Gibraltar in Kashmir that bring about in an all-out war in 1965 with India. Soon after the declaration of the Tashkent, calling for a ceasefire, brokered by the Soviet Union, he felt out with Ayub Khan, condemning him losing a war on the negotiation table after it had been won in the frontline. (Anwar, 1992)

### **2<sup>nd</sup> Phase of Bhutto’s Politics by Initiative of Pakistan People Party, 1966 till 1971**

This is when his 2<sup>nd</sup> phase of career began, after leaving the Ayub Khan government, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto reached out to liberal political activist, and socialist ideologues to gather their support. He organized Peoples Party in 1967 in Lahore, which was the capital of West Pakistan after words. His combination of Islamic tenets and egalitarianism and social honor ship with justice of the public goods and resources, democratic rule instructions and empowerment of the disregarded sections of the society made him famous overnight.



His persuasive was as powerful amongst the common people and peasantry as it was developing middle class that was influenced by the peace movements and global socialist against the remnants of colonialism, new-imperial western policies and right-wing dictatorship. (Shafqat, 1997)

### **Separation of East Pakistan**

General elections were apprehended on December 7<sup>th</sup> in Pakistan 1970, two elect members of the National Assembly. Since the independents of Pakistan there were the first democratic general elections were held and eventually the only ones held prior of the independence of East Pakistan, 'Bangladesh' (Shafqat, 1997) Finally in 300 constituencies, voting took place, of which 138 were in west Pakistan and 162 were in east Pakistan.

The elections were a suspicious competition between two democratic social parties, Pakistan People's Party and East Pakistan grounded the West Pakistan was centered by Awami League. Awami League was the one and only most important party in East wing,, meanwhile in the west part, the (PPP) was facing antagonism from the conservative factions of the Muslim League , the largest of which was Muslim League (Qayyum) along with Islamist Parties approximating Jammāt-I-Islami, (JI) Jamiat-Ulma-I-Islam, (JUI) Jamiat-Ulma-I-Pakistan, (JUP). The consequences were a success for the Awami League, which won an out-and-out majority of 160 seats, altogether, which were in East Pakistan. (Baxter, 1971)

### **PPP won merely 81 seats, entirely in West Pakistan**

After ten days later the Provincial elections were held and once again Awami League subjugated in East Pakistan, on the other side the PPP won only Sindh and Punjab. The Socialist National Awami Party was victorious in the Northwest frontier province and Baluchistan. The National Assembly was primarily not established as the military dictator the Yahya Khan and the PPP chairman Zulfikar Ali Bhutto did not want a heading the government from East Pakistan. In its place, Yahya selected the expert Bengali politician Nurul Amin for instance Prime Minister, further asking him to reach a negotiation between the Awami League and the PPP. (Chaudhry, 1973) ut unfortunately, this move failed as the interruption in inauguration had previously caused substantial turbulence in East Pakistan. The circumstances intensified into a civil war, which led to the breakup of the Pakistan and the foundation of the new independent state of Bangladesh. (William, 1972)

### **The 3<sup>rd</sup> Phase of Bhutto's politics as a democratic leader 1972 till 77**

The assembly was initiated after the resignation of Yahya Khan in 1972, and over handed power to Bhutto. In 1973 Bhutto became a prime minister of Pakistan. The 7<sup>th</sup> December elections were prove to be a bad luck for the country, which was directly led to the breakup of Pakistan, which scene as a big historic day because crores of Pakistanis used their right to vote and proclaim their sovereignty.



(Mehmood, 1991) The elections of National assembly and because of their enthusiasm, they created a golden chapter in the antiquity of struggle for democracy in Pakistan. Until just a couple of years before, a military dictator used to say that democracy was not suited to the nature of Pakistanis. By the voting process they proved that the people proclaimed they wanted social and political system change in the country as soon as possible. They stood every such slogan and party which stood for social change. (Khan, 2005)

The 3<sup>rd</sup> phase of his politics started when he became a first president of Pakistan in 1972, and then it's prime minister. He designated his administration a government of peoples and acquired the title of Quaid-I-Awam (Peoples Leader). His sustenance to words poor, the landless, laborers, students and women was unique to any other political leader. He prepared every political stakeholder sure to propagate a new and legitimately progressive constitution for the state.

He constructed institutions of learning, culture and devoted in a school network taking it to small and slum villages, created initial health facilities, distributed land amongst landless farmers, started infrastructure and housing schemes and mobilized foreign investment in industries. He is also the architect of Pakistan existing defense paradigm evidence on nuclear weapons and a Missal policy among other things. (Burki, 1980)

### **Economic Strategies**

The economic policies of the government of Bhutto rested on the premise that the mechanism of the leading enterprises was to be in the hands of the state. It must be pointed out that whereas this policy of Nationalization has been much criticized by opponents of Bhutto, his policies were a consideration of the times and of the age in which they were fulfilled. Since Bhutto's rise to electoral success was grounded on his accessible critique of Ayub Khans economic policies of functional discrimination resulting in the notorious 22 families concerns of restructuring, Nationalization and social sector development were fundamental to his economic program.

Accurately within days of taking overpower, in January 1972, Bhutto had Nationalized 30 main firms in 10 major industries in the large-scale manufacturing sector, basically in the capital and intermediate goods industry. His government had nationalized insurance companies, in 1972, and banks were to shadow in 1974, as were other industrial apprehensions in 1976. Furthermore, to Nationalization, general labor reforms were correspondingly originated by the Bhutto government, providing labor far greater rights than they had obligated in the past.

Bhutto's social populist agenda in a country was with need to break the industrial-financial connection a pillar, which at that time was primarily agricultural and rural, the honor ship of land determined social, political, and economic power. Bhutto had promised to disrupt the grip of the feudal. The manifesto of PPP laid the premise for this accomplishment by asserting that, "The breakup of the large states to abolish the feudal landowners is a national necessity that will have to be carried through



by practical procedures.”

The government had taken the decision that the land continued from landowners would not allow any compensation dissimilar 1959 reforms of the Ayub Khan and this land was to be disseminated free to landless tenets. The ceilings for land preserving were correspondingly censored from 500 acres of flooded land to 150 acres in 1972. Even though a lot of propaganda was shaken out the achievement of the 1972 reforms, the recommenced land was far less then was the circumstance in 1959, and simply one percent of the landless tenets and lesser owners profited from these methods. Nevertheless, approximating labor modifications, occupancy reforms for agricultural workers and for landless labor did provide those refining land far better usufruct and legal rights to the land than they already had.

Latterly with these essential involvements in the economy which reformed ownership outlines and property rights, and determined social-sector program, comprising among other things of the nationalization of schools, and initiating a people's health system providing free health care to every person was correspondingly. (Zahoor, 2011)

### **Bhutto's Reassurance in Making of Constitution of 1973**

The constitution of 1973 was comprised after piles of consequences and passing with the bitter experiences and long struggle by facing many ups and downs in 1956 and 1962 constitutions. It was hard luck with the country that constitutional progress took place with slow stride due to different hurdles behind the curtain. The constitution of Pakistan 1956 was a good stair. It was exceedingly unprejudiced, after the implementation due to convinced floss. It was the first practice at such a time when democracy was going to be overturn. The constitution could be enhanced gradually but the show of power politics did not aloud far ahead. (Mehmood, 1990)

The 1962 constitution of Pakistan, under Ayub regime was reflection of centralist affinities and was acknowledged as 'Man Show' and Syed Noor Ahmed rightly assumed that the position of president in the constitution was of 'Clock Tower' of Lyallpur. This constitution was abrogated after the failure of Ayub Khan. The Nation was victim of displeasure after the breakup of east Pakistan in 1971, laterally with other reasons one was of the constitutional instability in the country and ignoring the spirit of federalism because of the national life in Pakistan became paralyze.

After the letter of resignation of Yahya Khan, the powers were handed over to Z.A. Bhutto the majority Party leader of rest of Pakistan after 1971. The first and most important priority of the newly elected government was to make of constitution of the country. Similarly, all political parties and politicians were of the view that the constitution of our state should be assembled on parliamentary democracy. Few political parties were in the courtesy of a fragile federation and demanding additional authority and provincial autonomy for the provinces. (Bhutto, 1993)





The matter remained under debate for 2 years in the assembly. In the end, the constitution 1973 was permitted consistently and implemented on 14<sup>th</sup> august 1973. It was a federal parliamentary and Islamic constitution. The laws were usually started with convincing preamble which enlightens the bases and objectives of the said law. The preamble of the constitution was based on the principles of objective resolution. The objective resolution was universally approved in 1949 by the first constituent assembly of Pakistan. It proved to be a milestone in making constitution process of Pakistan. These all principles were comprised in the constitution of 1973. It is clearly defined as “Allah Almighty, if supreme sovereign over entire of the universe. Its most significant objective is that the determination of authority and power of government cannot be determined by the infinite human sovereign but is limited by the divine sphere of sovereignty.” The government and people of Pakistan have recognized the divine authority but could not shape the system of state on theocratic lines. (Jalal, 1995)

### **The Constitution Represented the Compromises Consensus on three Major Concerns**

Role of Islam; the sharing of powers between the federal government and the provinces; and the division of responsibilities between the president and the prime minister, with a significantly strengthened position for the hierarchy. The constitution provided for federal structure. The federal legislature is to function resembling to British parliament. To relieve fears of the provinces regarding dominion of the center, the constitution recognized a bicameral legislature with a Senet (the upper house) giving equivalent provincial representation, and a national assembly (the lower house) distributing seats according to the residents.

Islam has been declared as the state religion. The constitution entitled Pakistan as “The Islamic Republic of Pakistan.” Only a Muslim could become the president or the prime minister of the state. No law Repugnant to Islam shall be ratified and the present laws shall similarly be Islamized. The constitution sets-4<sup>th</sup> parliamentary structure of the government. The head of the government, according to the constitution, will be the prime minister of the state. The Prime minister and his cabinet are liable to the national assembly for his actions. The Prime minister would be elected by the national assembly majority.

The constitution announced a new institution acknowledged as the ‘council of Common Entrusts’ consisting of chief ministers of the provinces and an equitable number of ministers of the federal government designated by the prime ministers. The council could control and frame the policy in the 2<sup>nd</sup> part of the legislative list. In situation of complaint in intervention in water supply by any province the council would investigate the objection.

Another most important origination in the constitution of 1973 is the formation of a national finance commission (NFC) comprising of the federal and provincial finance ministers and other members to advise on distribution of revenues between the federation and provinces. The principle of strategy contains Islamic way of life, promotion of local government institutions, proper representation of



women in National life, protection of minorities, promotion of economic and social wellbeing of the people, and strengthening the pledges with the Muslim world and to work for the international peace. (<http://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/constitution/part2.ch1.html>), n.d.)

Under the constitution of 1973, consist of safeguards of as to arrest and detention, security of person, forced labor and prohibition of slavery, freedom of association, freedom of movement, freedom to speech, freedom to acknowledge religion and safeguards to religious foundations, non-discrimination in respect of additional to public places and in service, preservation of script and culture, languages. The judiciary enjoys proper supremacy over the other organs of the state. (The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan., 1973.)

### **Democratic down fall in 1977**

In every year July 5<sup>th</sup> is called to be a black day in Pakistan's political history, for democracy those who believe, whenever Zia over through an elected government of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. Zia's treasonous coup and his rule for a decade is rightly convicted and nobody would provocation find justifications in its favor. Though true it is our national psyche correspondingly we blame our exterior enemies completely for our anguishes without much craving reflecting on our own self. It is significant for us to learn from circumstances that instantly proceeded the coup of 1977. Expelling of an elected government was not an unparalleled event per se but it was a preface to a draconian chapter in Pakistan's history as it led to atrocious execution of Bhutto through an out accurately false judicial trial. When we retrospect the time proceeding that coup Bhutto was certainly the most widespread leader when Pakistan went to general elections in March 1977, yet he was far from being the unanimous choice of Pakistani electorate as his rule since December 1971 was occupied of political turbulence more often caused by his own conducts. Seen from Nation construction context in Pakistan, Bhutto had an exclusive opportunity to bind up the Nation and make a really new Pakistan following the 1971s civil war in east Pakistan which had caused in disintegration of Pakistan that Jinnah had formed in 1947. (Shafqat, 1997)

When Bhutto held 2<sup>nd</sup> time general elections in March 1977 his victory was convinced. What was not convinced was if PPP would get 2<sup>third</sup> majority in the elections so that he could change the country's constitution to his perception. To achieve that Bhutto unchecked police FSF, and ISI to intimidate down and scare away the opposition candidates first from filing their papers for election and then from running electoral campaign. Subsequently the PPP incredibly secured 77 percent of National Assembly seats far more than desired for 2-third majority which led to the opposition party's boycott of elections for provincial assemblies.

Bhutto's acts had hurled his rivals to a position where they had no stakes left in the system. Instead of mollifying opposition and resolving the deadlock, after a month of elections Bhutto executed martial law in Karachi, Hyder-a-bad and Lahore- the courage centers of opposition. That point on words surroundings simply slipped from Bhutto's control leading to his own expulsion in a military





coups two and a half months far ahead. Several would wonder exactly how we can precise all that clutter to Bhutto. The last two years of his life were totally contradictory to his 8 years in politics when he was working with non-elected rulers. This fragmented in his career is paralleled in the way he was seen –inducing extreme like and dislike.

For his supporters, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto Symbolizes the best elements in politics: struggle against inequality and poverty as well as sacrifices for democracy and civilian supremacy. For his critics, he remains the man who played a significant role in the partition of the country in 1971 and introduced policies that upset the economic and social steadiness. But Pakistan's history articulates us that Bhutto was seen as a savior of a democratic state Pakistan, Most courageous popular and a charismatic leader. (Bhutto, 2017)

## **Conclusion**

Bhutto had a first democratic leader in Pakistan, though he had a bottomless concern regarding problems of the state and on the other side he had made his place in the hearts of the peoples of Pakistan. He furthermore galvanized the Nation and released a flood of political perception in the people. The 1973 constitution of Pakistan, the Port Qasim industrial state, Pakistan's steel mills, the fertilizer plans, and few other examples of his tremendous contributions for Pakistan. Bhutto was a charismatic leader. Charisma comes and goes, depending upon the ruler's services and performance in response to the political principles within which he is functioning. Fascinating leaders provoke an unusual dilemma. They wish their efforts will outlast them and so they build institutions that may continue their contributions after they are gone.



## References

- Ali. P. S. (2007). *Human Rights in Islam*. New Delhi: Adam Publishers.
- Anwar H. S.. (1992). *The Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto*. (London: The Macmillan Printing Press), 6-6.
- Burki. (1980). *Pakistan Under Bhutto* (New York: StMartin's Press), 81-9.
- Craig B. March (1971). "Pakistan Votes 1971", *Asian Survey*, Vol.XI, No. 3,
- Chaudhry, G. W. (1973). *Last Days of United Pakistan*, London, c, Hurot and Company,
- Hussain M. and Hussain A. (1993). *Pakistan: Problems of Governance* (Lahore: Vanguard Books.), 126 - 130
- Jalal A. (1995). *Democracy and Authoritarianism in South Asia* (Lahore: Sang-i-Meel Publication.),
- Khan, H. (2005). *Constitutional and Political history of Pakistan*, Lahore, Oxford University Press.
- Khan, H. (2009). *Constitutional and Political History of Pakistan*.
- Khalid M., (1991). "Secession of East Pakistan," *Pakistan Defense Review*, Vol. 3, No. 2, December.
- Mahmood, Dr. (1990). "Safdar." *Constitutional Foundations of Pakistan*. Lahore, Jang Publication. Jalal, Democracy and Authoritarianism in South Asia, p. 83. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto: Political Behavior and Ouster from Power
- Pakistan, and Pakistan. National Assembly. (1973). *The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan*. Manager of Publications.
- Saeed S. (1989). *Political System of Pakistan and Public Policy* (Lahore: Progressive.), Ch. 6.
- Saeed S. (1997). *Civil-Military Relations in Pakistan: From Zulfikar Ali Bhutto to Benazir Bhutto* (Oxford: Westview Press), 57 – 60
- The Constitution of Pakistan. nd. (2020) "Chapter 1: 'Fundamental Rights' of Part II: 'Fundamental Rights and Principles of Policy.'" Retrieved December 29, (<http://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/constitution/part2.ch1.html>).
- Under Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, (2011) " Vol. XXXII, No. 1, January-June, *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture* (Islamabad: National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research), pp.



144-160.

Bhutto and the 1977 coup

William, R. B. (1972). *The East Pakistan Tragedy*, London, Tom Stacey Ltd.

Zahoor, M. A. (1969) "A Critical Appraisal of the Economic Reforms Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. Reshaping Foreign Policy: Statements, Articles, Speeches 1948-1966 (Rawalpindi: Pakistan Publications.), 173-175  
[/https://www.britannica.com/topic/democracy/England](https://www.britannica.com/topic/democracy/England)

Zulfikar Rao (2017) *Political Economy* July 9, <https://www.thenews.com.pk/tns/detail/563623-bhutto-1977-coupp>